

ZETA-TECH Associates, Inc. 900 Kings Highway North P.O. Box 8407 Cherry Hill, New Jersey 08002

August 17, 2006

Mr. Jim Gauntt The Railway Tie Association 115 Commerce Drive Suite C Fayetteville, GA 30214 FAX: (770) 460-5573

Dear Jim:

Enclosed please find our report "Development of Comparative Cross-Tie Unit Costs and Values".

If you have any questions or comments please give me a call.

Respectfully yours,

Allan M. Zarembski, Ph.D., P.E. President

Development of Comparative Cross-Tie Unit Costs and Values

August 2006

Prepared for:

Railway Tie Association

by:



ZETA-TECH Associates, Inc. 900 Kings Highway North, Suite 208 Cherry Hill, New Jersey 08034 (856) 779-7795 Fax: (856) 779-7436

www.zetatech.com

Development of Comparative Cross-Tie Unit Costs and Values

Introduction

This report presents the results of an analysis of Comparative cross-tie unit costs and values as a function of traffic and service. Specifically, this activity calculated the "value" of wood ties on a cost per ton mile basis as compared to competing tie types to include:

- Concrete
- Steel
- Plastic

These values were obtained for tangent and curved tracks, separately, as well as for an overall average track determined using an aggregated mix of tangent and curved track, with a distribution reflective of the US national average.

In addition, separate values were obtained for high, medium and low density trackage.

The results presented here-in also reflect the upgrade of the RTA SelecTie model using recently obtained costs and performance based on input from selected US Class 1 railroads. The updated SelecTie model has been submitted under separate cover.

Three distinct approaches were used in this analysis is as follows:

1. Simplified Analysis of Unit Costs

In this analysis, tie material and replacement (labor and equipment) costs were used to calculate a cost per mile of track, based on a full, one time replacement of all of the cross-ties.

2. Tie Replacement Life Cycle Costs

In this analysis, tie material and replacement (labor and equipment) costs were used to calculate a cost per mile of track, based on a 100 year life cycle cost analysis. In this analysis, wood, steel and plastic ties were replaced using conventional tie gangs, based on 25% replacement of ties per cycle. Note, this analysis is not appropriate for concrete ties because of the significant difference in cycles, due to the fact that concrete ties are replaced out of face (100% replacement).

3. Full SelecTie Life Cycle Cost Analysis

Concrete vs. Wood tie analysis was performed using the RTA SelecTie model, where all of the major maintenance activities addressed by the SelecTie model (to include tie replacement, rail replacement, surfacing, grinding, etc.) costs were used to calculate a cost per mile of track, based on a life cycle cost analysis. Maintenance cycles were activity specific

based on internal SelecTie life models. Most recent updated costs were used in SelecTie. Note, this analysis was limited to the wood vs. Concrete tie analysis.

It should be noted that because of the difference in time horizons, the actual costs per unit of traffic (\$/mile/MGT) differ significantly between the three methods. However the relative ranking and ratio can be used for comparison of wood against the other tie materials.

Tie Lives and Costs

Based on a survey of selected US railroads and suppliers, the following costs have been defined for wood, concrete, steel and plastic (composite) ties.

	Wood	Concrete 1	Concrete 2	Plastic	Steel 1*	Steel 2*
Unit cost	\$95.00	\$250.00	\$200.00	\$135.00	\$140.00	\$140.00
Ties/mile	3,250	2,640	2,640	3,250	3,250	2,880
Cost/mile	\$308,750	\$660,000	\$528,000	\$438,750	\$455,000	\$403,200

Notes:

- Concrete 1 represents costs of complete out-of-phase installation of concrete track as part of new construction, based on the costs of a major US Class 1 railroad.
- Concrete 2 represents 2/3 of the labor and equipment costs reported for concrete 1 and is considered a "lower bound" cost for cases with very high rates of tie installation productivity.
- Steel 1 is based on a standard tie spacing of 19 ¹/₂ inches
- Steel 2 is based on a tie spacing of 22 inches which is reported as being used in applications for steel ties
- Material costs include both tie and fastener costs.

*Also note; steel ties are very sensitive to the cost of steel, which has been rising recently. This cost may be significantly low in terms of future steel tie costs.

Tie Lives are calculated based on the revised SelecTie model which has been calibrated to reported tie lives from major US Class 1 railroads.

Note: Tie lives are defined for three classes of annual tonnage:

- Low: 10 MGT per year
- Moderate: 25 MGT per year
- High: 50 MGT per year

Tie lives are defined for the following curvature classes:

- Tangent
- Moderate: defined here as 4 degree

A composite curvature value is also calculated based on track that is 80% tangent and 20% curved (to reflect a distribution identified on selected US railway routes)

Finally, wood tie lives are also reported as a function of climatic condition as follows:

- "Dry" Climate Track Representative of Western US
- Moderate Climate Track: Representative of Northern US
- "Wet" Climate Track: Representative of Southeastern US

These lives are defined as follows:

Wood Tie Life							
"Dry" Climate							
Track	Curve (deg)						
MGT	0	4	Aggregate				
10	50	39	47.8				
25	40	33	38.6				
50	36	28	34.4				
10 25 50	50 40 36	39 33 28	47.8 38.6 34.4				

Moderate Climate Track		Curve	(deg)
MGT	0	4	Aggregate
10	45	36	43.5
25	38	30	36.2
50	33	26	31.5

"Wet" Climate			
Track		Curve	(deg)
MGT	0	4	Aggregate
10	34	27	32.8
25	29	22	27.3
50	25	19	24

Co	nc	ret	e

	Curve (deg)				
MGT	0 4 Aggregat				
10	60	53	58.6		
25	51	45	49.8		
50	46	41	45		

In the case of plastic or composite ties; the tie life was assumed to be comparable to dry climate track wood tie life. However, this performance has not yet been confirmed by field experience.

	Curve (deg)				
MGT	0	4	Aggregate		
10	50	39	47.8		
25	40	33	38.6		
50	36	28	34.4		

Plastic Tie Life

In the case of steel ties; the tie life was assumed to be an average of concrete and dry
climate track wood tie life. However, this performance has not yet been confirmed by
field experience:

	Curve (deg)					
MGT	0 4 Aggregat					
10	55	46	53.2			
25	45.5	39	44.2			
50	41	34.5	39.7			

Simplified Analysis of Unit Costs

In this analysis, tie material and replacement (labor and equipment) costs were used to calculate a cost per mile of track, based on a full, one time replacement of all of the crossties. The updated SelecTie tie life model was used to calculate the life of the tie, in years, as a function of traffic density, as noted in the previous section. Using the tie life in years and the annual MGT, a tie life in MGT was calculated. Using the costs defined in the previous section, the unit cost, defined here \$/mile/MGT was calculated for five of the six cases defined previously (the Steel 2 case, with a 22 inch tie spacing was not considered a realistic case for main line track and was not included.).

Using these unit costs (\$/mile/MGT), the ratio of wood tie to alternate tie cost was also calculated. Note, when this ratio is less than 1, it means that the unit cost of the wood ties is less than the alternate ties. If it is greater than 1, it means the cost of the alternate ties is less.

The calculated costs are as follows:

"Dry" Climate Track (Western US)								
Life Wood Ties		Tang	gent	Mod Curve		Aggregated Track		
	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT	
Low Tonnage	10	50	500	39	390	47.8	478	
Med Tonnage	25	40	1000	33	825	38.6	965	
High Tonnage	50	36	1800	28	1400	34.4	1720	
Cost Wood Ties		Tang	gent	Mod Curve		Aggregated Track		
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT							
Low Tonnage	10	\$618		\$792		\$646		
Med Tonnage	25	\$309		\$374		\$320		
High Tonnage	50	\$172		\$221		\$180		

For Wood Ties

Moderate Climate Track (Northern US)								
Life Wood Ties		Tan	gent	Mod Curve		Aggregated Track		
	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT	
Low Tonnage	10	45	455	36	356	43.5	435	
Med Tonnage	25	38	947	30	742	36.2	906	
High Tonnage	50	33	1649	26	1292	31.5	1577	
Cost Wood Ties		Tan	gent	Mod C	Curve	Aggregate	d Track	
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT							
Low Tonnage	10	\$679		\$866		\$709		
Med Tonnage	25	\$326		\$416		\$341		
High Tonnage	50	\$187		\$239		\$196		

"Wet" Climate Track (Southeast US)										
Life Wood Ties		Tan	gent	Mod (Curve	Aggregated Track				
	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	34	343	27	269	32.8	328			
Med Tonnage	25	29	714	22	560	27.3	684			
High Tonnage	50	25	1244	19	975	23.8	1190			
Cost Wood Ties		Tan	gent	Mod Curve		Aggregated Track				
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT									
Low Tonnage	10	\$899		\$1,148		\$940				
Med Tonnage	25	\$432		\$552		\$452				
High Tonnage	50	\$248		\$317		\$259				

For Concrete Ties

Life Concrete 1		Tangent		Mod C	urve	Aggregate	ed Track
	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT
Low Tonnage	10	60	600	53	530	58.6	586
Med Tonnage	25	51	1275	45	1125	49.8	1245
High Tonnage	50	46	2300	41	2050	45	2250
Cost Concrete Ties		Tan	gent	Mod Curve		Aggregate	ed Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT						
Low Tonnage	10	\$1,100		\$1,245		\$1,126	
Med Tonnage	25	\$518		\$587		\$530	
High Tonnage	50	\$287		\$322		\$293	

Life Concrete 2		Tangent		t Mod Curve Aggregated Track		ed Track	
	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT
Low Tonnage	10	60	600	53	530	58.6	586
Med Tonnage	25	51	1275	45	1125	49.8	1245
High Tonnage	50	46	2300	41	2050	45	2250
Cost Concrete Ties 2		Tanç	gent	Mod Curve		Aggregate	ed Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT						
Low Tonnage	10	\$880		\$996		\$901	
Med Tonnage	25	\$414		\$469		\$424	
High Tonnage	50	\$230		\$258		\$235	

For Plastic (Composite Ties)

Life Plastic		Tang	gent	Mod C	urve	Aggregate	ed Track
	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT
Low Tonnage	10	50	500	39	390	47.8	478
Med Tonnage	25	40	1000	33	825	38.6	965
High Tonnage	50	36	1800	28	1400	34.4	1720
Cost Plastic Ties		Tan	gent	Mod Curve		Aggregate	ed Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT						
Low Tonnage	10	\$878		\$1,125		\$918	
Med Tonnage	25	\$439		\$532		\$455	
High Tonnage	50	\$244		\$313		\$255	

For Steel Ties

Life Steel 1		Tan	gent	Mod C	urve	Aggregate	d Track
	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT	Years	MGT
Low Tonnage	10	55	550	46	460	53.20	532
Med Tonnage	25	45.5	1137.5	39	975	44.20	1105
High Tonnage	50	41	2050	34.5	1725	39.70	1985
Cost Steel Ties		Tan	gent	Mod C	urve	Aggregate	d Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT						
Low Tonnage	10	\$827		\$989		\$855	
Med Tonnage	25	\$400		\$467		\$412	
High Tonnage	50	\$222		\$264		\$229	

Based on the above unit costs, the following wood/alternate tie unit cost ratios were calculated:

Wood/Concrete 1	Tan	igent	Mod Curve	Aggregated Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	0.56	0.64	0.57
Med Tonnage	25	0.60	0.64	0.60
High Tonnage	50	0.60	0.68	0.61

For "Dry" Climate Track (Western US)

			Mod	Aggregated
Wood/Concrete 2	Tangent		Curve	Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	0.70	0.79	0.72
Med Tonnage	25	0.75	0.80	0.75
High Tonnage	50	0.75	0.86	0.76

Wood/Plastic	Tang	gent	Mod Curve	Aggregated Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	0.70	0.70	0.70
Med Tonnage	50	0.70	0.70	0.70
High Tonnage	50	0.70	0.70	0.70

			Mod	Aggregated
Wood/Steel 1	Tangent		Curve	Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	0.75	0.80	0.76
Med Tonnage	25	0.77	0.80	0.78
High Tonnage	50	0.77	0.84	0.79

For Moderate Climate Track

			Mod	Aggregated
Wood/Concrete 1	Tangent		Curve	Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	0.62	0.70	0.63
Med Tonnage	25	0.63	0.71	0.64
High Tonnage	50	0.65	0.74	0.67

			Mod	Aggregated
Wood/Concrete 2	Tangent		Curve	Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	0.77	0.87	0.79
Med Tonnage	50	0.79	0.89	0.80
High Tonnage	50	0.82	0.93	0.83

Wood/Plastic	Tangent		Mod Curve	Aggregated Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	0.77	0.77	0.77
Med Tonnage	25	0.74	0.78	0.75
High Tonnage	50	0.77	0.76	0.77

Wood/Stool 1	Tangent		Mod	Aggregated
WOOU/Steel I	rang	ent	Curve	Hack
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	0.82	0.88	0.83
Med Tonnage	25	0.82	0.89	0.83
High Tonnage	50	0.84	0.91	0.86

For "Wet"	Climate Track	(representative of S	Southeastern US))
-----------	----------------------	----------------------	------------------	---

			Mod	Aggregated
Wood/Concrete 1	Tangent		Curve	Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	0.82	0.92	0.83
Med Tonnage	25	0.83	0.94	0.85
High Tonnage	50	0.86	0.98	0.88

Wood/Concrete 2	Tangent		Mod Curve	Aggregated Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	1.02	1.15	1.04
Med Tonnage	25	1.04	1.18	1.07
High Tonnage	50	1.08	1.23	1.11

			Mod	Aggregated
Wood/Plastic	Tangent		Curve	Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	1.02	1.02	1.02
Med Tonnage	25	0.98	1.04	1.00
High Tonnage	50	1.02	1.01	1.02

			Mod	Aggregated
Wood/Steel 1	Tangent		Curve	Track
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT			
Low Tonnage	10	1.09	1.16	1.10
Med Tonnage	25	1.08	1.18	1.10
High Tonnage	50	1.12	1.20	1.13

Tie Replacement Life Cycle Costs

In this analysis, tie material and replacement (labor and equipment) costs were used to calculate a cost per mile of track, based on a 100 year life cycle cost analysis. In this analysis, wood, steel and plastic ties were replaced using conventional tie gangs, based on 25% replacement of ties per cycle. Note, this analysis is not appropriate for concrete ties because of the significant difference in cycles, due to the fact that concrete ties are replaced out of face (100% replacement) and thus are not included here. (see SelecTie analysis in next section).

Value of Money	8%
Time Horizon	100 years
Medium Tonnage	MGT = 25 MGT/yr
Tangent Track	

Using the above-defined cost of money and life cycle parameters, the following life cycle costs were calculated for the six types of ties analyzed.

Wood life cycle "dry" climate track				
Bas	ed on 812.5 ties	per mile per cycle c	ycle = 0.25 life	
	Cos	t per cycle \$73,125		
	Tie Life = 40	Oyears cycle = 10	years	
Cycle	Years	Factor	Cost	
0	0	1.00000	\$77,188	
1	10	0.46319	\$35,753	
2	20	0.21455	\$16,560	
3	30	0.09938	\$7,671	
4	40	0.04603	\$3,553	
5	50	0.02132	\$1,646	
6	60	0.00988	\$762	
7	70	0.00457	\$353	
8	80	0.00212	\$164	
9	90	0.00098	\$76	
10	100	0.00045	\$35	
Totals 1.86248 \$143,760			\$143,760	
	Total MGT=	2500		
\$/mile/MGT \$58				

Moderate Tonnage Tangent Track

Wood life cycle moderate climate track					
Based or	Based on 812.5 ties per mile per cycle cycle=0.25life				
	Cost per o	cycle \$73,125			
Tie	e Life= 38years	cycle= 9.	47 years		
Cycle	Years	Factor	Cost		
0	0	1.00000	\$77,188		
1	9	0.48253	\$37,246		
2	19	0.23284	\$17,972		
3	28	0.11235	\$8,672		
4	38	0.05421	\$4,185		
5	47	0.02616	\$2,019		
6	57	0.01262	\$974		
7	66	0.00609	\$470		
8	76	0.00294	\$227		
9	85	0.00142	\$109		
10	95	0.00068	\$53		
	Totals	1.93186	\$149,115		
	Total MGT=	2367			
	\$/mile/MGT	\$63			

Wood life cycle "wet" climate track					
Based o	Based on 812.5 ties per mile per cycle cycle = 0.25 life				
	Cost per	r cycle \$73,125			
Т	ie Life = 29 years	s cycle = 7.	14 years		
Cycle	Years	Factor	Cost		
0	0	1.00000	\$77,188		
1	7	0.57702	\$44,539		
2	14	0.33295	\$25,700		
3	21	0.19212	\$14,829		
4	29	0.11086	\$8,557		
5	36	0.06397	\$4,937		
6	43	0.03691	\$2,849		
7	50	0.02130	\$1,644		
8	57	0.01229	\$949		
9	64	0.00709	\$547		
10	71	0.00409	\$316		
11	79	0.00236	\$182		
12	86	0.00136	\$105		
13	93	0.00079	\$61		
14	100	0.00045	\$35		
	Totals	2.36355	\$182,437		
	Total MGT=	2501			
	\$/mile/MGT	\$73			

	Plastic life cycle				
Based o	n 812.5 ties pe	r mile per cycle	e cycle = 0.25life		
	Cost pe	r cycle \$105,62	25		
-	Tie Life = 40 ye	ars cycle	= 10years		
Cycle	Years	Factor	Cost		
0	0	1.00000	\$109,688		
1	10	0.46319	\$50,807		
2	20	0.21455	\$23,533		
3	30	0.09938	\$10,900		
4	40	0.04603	\$5,049		
5	50	0.02132	\$2,339		
6	60	0.00988	\$1,083		
7	70	0.00457	\$502		
8	80	0.00212	\$232		
9	90	0.00098	\$108		
10	100	0.00045	\$50		
	Totals	1.86248	\$204,290		
	Total MGT=	2500			
	\$/mile/MGT	\$82			

	Steel 1 life cycle					
Based on	Based on 812.5 ties per mile per cycle cycle = 0.25 life					
	Cost per	cycle \$109,68	8			
Tie	Life = 45.5 year	rs cycle = 1	1.375 years			
Cycle	Years	Factor	Cost			
0	0	1.00000	\$113,750			
1	11	0.41668	\$47,398			
2	23	0.17362	\$19,750			
3	34	0.07235	\$8,229			
4	46	0.03015	\$3,429			
5	57	0.01256	\$1,429			
6	68	0.00523	\$595			
7	80	0.00218	\$248			
8	91	0.00091	\$103			
9	102	0.00038	\$43			
	Totals	1.71406	\$194,974			
	Total MGT=	2559				
	\$/mile/MGT	\$76				

Based on the above unit costs, the following wood/alternate tie unit cost ratios were calculated:

For Moderate tonnage (25 MGT) tangent track

For "Dry" Climate Track (Western US	5)
-------------------------------------	----

wood-dry/Plastic	0.70
wood-dry/Steel 1	0.75

For Moderate Climate Track

wood-mod/Plastic	0.77
wood-mod/Steel 1	0.83

For "Wet" Climate Track (e.g. Southeastern US)

wood-"wet"/Plastic	0.89
wood-"wet"/Steel 1	0.96

For Moderate tonnage (25 MGT) curved track

Wood life cycle dry climate track			
Based on	Based on 812.5 ties per mile per cycle cycle = 0.25 life		
	Cost per	cycle \$73,125	
Tie	Life = 33 years	cycle = 8	.25 years
Cycle	Years	Factor	Cost
0	0	1.00000	\$77,188
1	8.25	0.52997	\$40,907
2	16.5	0.28087	\$21,680
3	24.75	0.14885	\$11,490
4	33	0.07889	\$6,089
5	41.25	0.04181	\$3,227
6	49.5	0.02216	\$1,710
7	57.75	0.01174	\$906
8	66	0.00622	\$480
9	74.25	0.00330	\$255
10	82.5	0.00175	\$135
11	90.75	0.00093	\$72
12	99	0.00049	\$38
	Totals	2.12699	\$164,177
	Total MGT=	2475	
	\$/mile/MGT	\$66	

Wood life cycle moderate climate track			
Based on	Based on 812.5 ties per mile per cycle cycle = 0.25 life		
	Cost per o	cycle \$73,125	
Tie	e Life = 30 years	cycle = 7.	50 years
Cycle	Years	Factor	Cost
0	0	1.00000	\$77,188
1	8	0.56146	\$43,338
2	15	0.31524	\$24,333
3	23	0.17700	\$13,662
4	30	0.09938	\$7,671
5	38	0.05580	\$4,307
6	45	0.03133	\$2,418
7	53	0.01759	\$1,358
8	60	0.00988	\$762
9	68	0.00554	\$428
10	75	0.00311	\$240
11	83	0.00175	\$135
12	90	0.00098	\$76
13	98	0.00055	\$43
	Totals	2.27961	\$175,957
	Total MGT=	2438	
	\$/mile/MGT	\$72	

Wood life cycle "wet" climate track			
Based on 812.5 ties per mile per cycle cycle = 0.25 life			
	Cost pe	er cycle \$73,125	
Т	ie Life = 22 yea	rs cycle = 5	.50 years
Cycle	Years	factor	Cost
0	0	1.00000	\$77,188
1	6	0.65489	\$50,549
2	11	0.42888	\$33,104
3	17	0.28087	\$21,680
4	22	0.18394	\$14,198
5	28	0.12046	\$9,298
6	33	0.07889	\$6,089
7	39	0.05166	\$3,988
8	44	0.03383	\$2,612
9	50	0.02216	\$1,710
10	55	0.01451	\$1,120
11	61	0.00950	\$734
12	66	0.00622	\$480
13	72	0.00408	\$315
14	77	0.00267	\$206
15	83	0.00175	\$135
16	88	0.00114	\$88
17	94	0.00075	\$58
18	99	0.00049	\$38
	Totals	2.89671	\$223,590
	Total MGT=	2475	
	\$/mile/MGT	\$90	

Plastic life cycle				
Based	Based on 812.5 ties per mile per cycle cycle = 0.25 life			
	Cost pe	er cycle \$105,62	25	
	Tie Life = 33 yea	ars cycle =	8.25 years	
Cycle	Years	factor	Cost	
0	0	1.00000	\$109,688	
1	8.25	0.52997	\$58,131	
2	16.5	0.28087	\$30,808	
3	24.75	0.14885	\$16,327	
4	33	0.07889	\$8,653	
5	41.25	0.04181	\$4,586	
6	49.5	0.02216	\$2,430	
7	57.75	0.01174	\$1,288	
8	66	0.00622	\$683	
9	74.25	0.00330	\$362	
10	82.5	0.00175	\$192	
11	90.75	0.00093	\$102	
12	99	0.00049	\$54	
	Totals	2.12699	\$233,304	
	Total MGT=	2475		
	\$/mile/MGT	\$94		

Steel 1 life cycle			
Based o	Based on 812.5 ties per mile per cycle cycle = 0.25 life		
	Cost per	cycle \$109,68	8
Т	ie Life = 39 year	s cycle =	9.75 years
Cycle	Years	factor	Cost
0	0	1.00000	\$113,750
1	10	0.47219	\$53,712
2	20	0.22297	\$25,362
3	29	0.10528	\$11,976
4	39	0.04971	\$5,655
5	49	0.02347	\$2,670
6	59	0.01108	\$1,261
7	68	0.00523	\$595
8	78	0.00247	\$281
9	88	0.00117	\$133
10	98	0.00055	\$63
	Totals	1.89413	\$215,458
	Total MGT=	2438	
	\$/mile/MGT	\$88	

Based on the above unit costs, the following wood/alternate tie unit cost ratios were calculated:

For Moderate tonnage (25 MGT) curved track

For "Dry" Climate Track (Western US)

wood-"dry"/Plastic	0.70
wood-"dry"/Steel 1	0.75

For Moderate Climate Track

wood-mod/Plastic	0.77
wood-mod/Steel 1	0.82

For "Wet" Climate Track (e.g. Southeastern US)

wood-"wet"/Plastic	0.96
wood-"wet"/Steel 1	1.02

Full SelecTie Life Cycle Cost Analysis

Concrete vs. Wood tie analysis was performed using the RTA SelecTie model, where all of the major maintenance activities addressed by the SelecTie model (to include tie replacement, rail replacement, surfacing, grinding, etc.) costs were used to calculate a cost per mile of track, based on a life cycle cost analysis. Maintenance cycles were activity specific based on internal SelecTie life models. Most recent updated costs were used in SelecTie. Note, this analysis was limited to the wood vs. Concrete tie analysis.

Using SelecTie to compare wood vs Concrete tie track over the total life cycle of the analysis results in the costs shown in the Figure 1 below for wood tie track in a dry environment, moderate tonnage and no curvature.

Figure 1: SelecTie Analysis Wood ("dry" climate track) vs. Concrete; Moderate Density; Tangent Track



As can be seen from Figure 1, the Present Value of the Wood Tie track costs is \$247,986. The corresponding Present Value of the Concrete Tie track costs is \$435,329. The resulting ratio of Wood ("dry" climate track) to concrete is 0.57

Figure 2 presents the comparison of wood vs. concrete tie track for wood tie track in a moderate environment, moderate tonnage and no curvature.

MA SelecTie II		×
File Edit Inputs Utilities Window Help		
D 🗢 🖬 🔁 🎒 🔁 🔁	🔤 🖶 🕶 15 ms 18 🔇 🖬 🗷 📷 💙 🗹 😽	
🗟 tanmedwoodmodvC1.RTA		^
StammedwoodmodyC1.RTA Input Summary Curvature: 0.00 Wheel Load: 33000 Speed: 45 Annual MGT: 25 Grade: 0 Wheel Load: 33000 Speed: 45 Rail Wt: 132 Enter Comments for your Current SelecTie Session. • Economic Results by Cost Category • Anchor Adjustment • Daily Equipment Costs: \$160 Daily Equipment Costs: \$160 Daily Labor Costs: \$100 N/A \$0 Material Costs: \$0 Daily Costs/Mile: \$505 Daily Costs/Mile: \$505 Present Value Costs: \$1224 Present Value Difference: \$1,224	Economic Summary PV Costs/Mile Activity Wood Concrete Delta Basic Force: \$46,875 \$39,094 \$7,781 Rail Replacement: \$25,992 \$17,913 \$8,000 Rail Replacement: \$52,335 \$2,314 \$52,022 Concrete Tie Repair: \$0 \$7,645 \$7,645 Surfacing: \$15,5600 \$12,583 \$3,097 Undercutting (Maint): \$30,347 \$21,834 \$8,512 Rail Grinding: \$50 \$50 \$0 Gaging: \$25,940 \$0 \$25,940 Anchor Adjustment: \$1,224 \$0 \$1,224 Fuel Usage: \$0 \$0 \$0 Conv. to Concrete Ties: \$38,999 \$297,851 \$258,862 Undercutting (Conversion): \$0 \$34,708 \$34,708 Total: \$253,336 \$438,523 \$34,708 Net Benefit of Wood Ties: \$185,188 \$101 for Concrete Ties: \$63,08	
🛃 start 📄 2 Windows Ex 🔹 🊻 9	SelecTie II 💽 Inbox - Microsof 👿 2 Microsoft Word 🔹 🔇 🖻 🍇 🗊 💽 6:06 F	РМ

Figure 2: SelecTie Analysis Wood (moderate climate track) vs. Concrete; Moderate Density; Tangent Track

As can be seen from Figure 2, the Present Value of the Wood Tie track costs is \$253,336 the corresponding Present Value of the Concrete Tie track costs is \$438,523. The resulting ratio of Wood (moderate climate track) to Concrete is 0.58

Figure 3 presents the comparison of wood vs. concrete tie track for wood tie track in a wet environment, moderate tonnage and no curvature.

Figure 3: SelecTie Analysis Wood ("wet" climate track) vs. Concrete; Moderate Density; Tangent Track

MA SelecTie II			
File Edit Inputs Utilities Window Help			
D 🕞 🖬 📬 🎒 🛍 🛍	🎬 🕕 🚼 IS 🔊 🌾	🔿 🖬 🗷 📼 🏓	✓ №
💐 tanmedwoodmodvC1.RTA			A A A A
Input Summary Curvature: 0.00 Annual MGT: 25 Grade: 0 Mibbel Load: 20000	- Economic Summary	PV Costs/Mile	
Speed: 45 Rail Wt: 132	Activity Wood Basic Force: C4C 05	<u>Concrete</u> <u>Delta</u>	
Enter Comments for your Current SelecTie Session.	Rail Replacement: \$25,99 Rail Transposing: \$13,95 Tie Installation: \$65,56 Comprete Tie Respire: \$25	3 \$5,004 \$7,701 12 \$17,913 -\$8,080 14 \$4,581 -\$9,372 12 \$2,314 -\$63,268 14 \$17,913 -\$63,268	
Economic Results by Cost Category	Surfacing: \$15.68	0 \$12,583 -\$3,097	
Anchor Adjustment	Undercutting (Maint): \$30,32	7 \$21,834 -\$8,512	
<u>Cost Item Wood Concrete</u>	Rail Grinding: \$0	\$0 \$0	
Daily Equipment Costs: \$160 \$0	Anchor Adjustment: \$1222	U ŞU -\$34,840 I \$0 -\$1,224	
Daily Labor Costs: \$425 \$0	Fuel Usage: \$0	\$0 \$0	
Productivity Rates: 1.00 N/A	Derailment: \$0	\$0 \$0	
Material Losts: Jao Jao	Conv. to Concrete Ties: \$38,98	9 \$297,851 \$258,862	
Daily Costs/Mile: \$585	Undercutting (Conversion): \$0	\$34,708 \$34,708	
Life Cycles: 4.10 N/A	Totals: \$273,4	82 \$441,054	
Present Value Costs: \$1,224 \$0	Net Benefit of Wood Ties: \$16	7,573	
Present Value Difference: -\$1,224	ROI for Concrete Ties: -57.	08	
			_
			v
🛃 start 📄 🗅 2 Windows Ex 👻 🚻 9	elecTie II 💽 Inbox	- Microsof 🛛 👿 2 Mici	osoft Word 🕞 🔇 🚍 🍇 👼 📘 6:11 PM 👘

As can be seen from Figure 3, the Present Value of the Wood Tie track costs is \$273,482 the corresponding Present Value of the Concrete Tie track costs is \$441,054. The resulting ratio of Wood ("wet" climate track) to Concrete is 0.62

In the case of curved track, Figure 4 presents the comparison of wood vs. concrete tie track for wood tie track in a dry environment, moderate tonnage and moderate curvature.

Figure 4: SelecTie Analysis Wood ("dry" climate track) vs. Concrete; Moderate Density; Curved Track

🌃 SelecTie II		a 🗙
File Edit Inputs Utilities Window Help		
🗅 🗁 🖬 📬 🎒 👫 📬 🛍 Save All	🞬 🕀 🕶 15 🍻 15 🐼 🖬 🗷 📼 💙 🗹 😢	
4medwoodmodvC1.RTA		-
Input Summary Curvature: 4.00 Annual MGT: 25 Grade: 0 Wheel Load: 33000	Economic Summary PV Costs/Mile Activity Hand Constant Poly	
Speed: 45 Rail Wt: 132	ACTIVITY WOOD CONCrete Detta Basic Force: C46.875 C39.094 C37.781	
Enter Comments for your Current SelecTie Session.	Solid Sector Solid Sector Solid Sector Solid Sector Rail Replacement: \$56,778 \$41,425 -\$15,353 Rail Transposing: \$21,948 \$7,359 -\$14,590 Tie Installation: \$59,979 \$4,124 -\$58,855 Concerts: Tie Repair: \$0 \$51,004	
Economic Results by Cost Category	Surfacing: \$15.680 \$12.583 -\$3.097	
Anchar Adjustment	Undercutting (Maint): \$30,347 \$21,834 -\$8,512	
Cost Item Wood Concrete	Rail Grinding: \$17,291 \$26,272 \$8,981	
Della Regiment Costs: \$160 \$0	Gaging: \$30,449 \$0 -\$30,449	
Daily Labor Costs: \$425 \$0	Anchor Adjustment: \$1,224 \$0 -\$1,224	
Productivity Rates: 1.00 N/A	Persidment co co co	-
Material Costs: \$0 \$0	Conv. to Concrete Ties: 038 989 0297 851 0258 862	
Daily Costs/Mile: 🔽 😒	Undercutting (Conversion): \$0 \$34,708 \$34,708	
Life Cycles: 4.10 N/A	Totals: \$319,560 \$491,388	
Present Value Costs: \$1,224 \$0	Net Benefit of Wood Ties: \$171,828	
Present Value Difference: -\$1,224	ROI for Concrete Ties: -58.53	
		~
🛃 start 📄 2 Windows Ex 👻 🌇	SelecTie II 💽 Inbox - Microsof 🔃 2 Microsoft Word 🕞 🔇 🖀 🏂 돈 6:2	O PM

As can be seen from Figure 4, the Present Value of the Wood Tie track costs is \$319,560. The corresponding Present Value of the Concrete Tie track costs is \$491,388. The resulting ratio of Wood ("dry" climate track) to concrete is 0.65

Figure 5 presents the comparison of wood vs. concrete tie track for wood tie track in a moderate environment, moderate tonnage and moderate curvature.

NA SelecTie II		×
File Edit Inputs Utilities Window Help		
D 🗁 🖬 🖬 🖉 👗 🖻 🛍	🞬 🕀 🖽 📧 🍻 🌆 🛇 🖬 🗷 📷 💌 🔽 📢	
tanmedwoodmodvC1.RTA		^
Input Summary Curvature: 400 Grade: 0 Speed: 45 Wheel Load: 33000 Speed: 45 Rail Wt: 132 Enter Comments for your Current SelecTie Session. Image: Second	Economic Summary PV Costs/Mile Activity Wood Concrete Delta Basic Force: \$46,875 \$39,094 \$57,781 Rail Replacement: \$56,778 \$41,425 \$15,353 Rail Transposing: \$21,948 \$7,359 \$14,590 Te Installation: \$63,836 \$4,124 \$59,712 Concrete Tie Repair: \$0 \$10,138 \$10,138 Surfacing: \$15,680 \$21,283 \$3097 Undercutting (Maint): \$30,347 \$21,834 \$8512 Rail Grinding: \$17,291 \$26,272 \$8,981 Gaging: \$33,479 \$0 \$33,479 Anchor Adjustment: \$1,224 \$0 \$1,224 Fuel Usage: \$0 \$0 \$0 Conv. to Concrete Ties: \$38,989 \$297,851 \$258,862 Undercutting (Conversion): \$0 \$34,708 \$34,708 Conv. to Concrete Ties: \$368,981 \$344,708 \$344,708 Undercutting (Conversion): \$36	
		⊻
🛃 start 📄 2 Windows Ex 👻 🊻 S	SelecTie II 🔯 Inbox - Microsof 👿 2 Microsoft Word 🕞 🔿 😭 🗞 🔿 💽 6:18 PM	

Figure 5: SelecTie Analysis Wood (moderate climate track) vs. Concrete; Moderate Density; Curved Track

As can be seen from Figure 5, the Present Value of the Wood Tie track costs is \$326,447 the corresponding Present Value of the Concrete Tie track costs is \$495,388. The resulting ratio of Wood (moderate climate track) to Concrete is 0.66

Figure 6 presents the comparison of wood vs. concrete tie track for wood tie track in a "wet" environment, moderate tonnage and moderate curvature..

Figure 6: SelecTie Analysis Wood ("wet" climate track) vs. Concrete; Moderate Density; Curved Track

🚻 SelecTie II	_ 7 🗙
File Edit Inputs Utilities Window Help	
🗟 tanmedwoodmodvC1.RTA	<u>></u>
Input Summary Economic Summary	
Curvature: 400 Annual MGT: 25 PV Costs/Mile	
Speed 45 Rail Mt 122	
Basic Profice. S46,875 S39,094 -\$7,781	
Enter Comments for your Current SelecTie Session.	
Tie Installation: \$78,841 \$4,124 -\$74,317	
Concrete Tie Repair: \$0 \$13,275 \$13,275	
Economic Results by Cost Category Surfacing: \$15,680 \$12,583 \$3,097	
Anchor Adjustment S30347 \$21,834 -\$85,12	
Cost Item Wood Concrete Grama SALATA SALATATA SALATATA SALATATA SALATATA SALATATA SALATATA SALATATA SALATATA SALATATA SAL	
Daily Equipment Costs: S160 S0 Anchor Adjustment: S1224 S0 -51224	
D aily Labor Costs: \$425 SU Fuel Usage: \$0 \$0 \$0	
Motority Rate: 100 PVCA Decalment S0 S0 S0	
Date Cath Max	
Life Cycles: 4.10 N/A Totals: \$352,306 \$498,525	
Present Value Costs: \$1.224 \$0 Net Benefit of Wood Ties: \$146,218	
Present Value Difference: -\$1,224 ROI for Concrete Ties: -49.81	
	~
🛃 Start 📄 2 Windows Ex 👻 🚻 SelecTie II 💽 Inbox - Microsof 🔤 2 Microsoft Word 🗸 🔇 😤 🍇 🕯	6:16 PM

As can be seen from Figure 6, the Present Value of the Wood Tie track costs is \$352,306. The corresponding Present Value of the Concrete Tie track costs is \$498,525. The resulting ratio of Wood ("wet" climate track) to Concrete is 0.71.

Based on the above unit costs, the following wood/alternate tie unit cost ratios were calculated:

For Moderate tonnage (25 MGT) tangent and curved track

For "Dry" Climate Track (Western US)

wood-"dry"/Concrete Tangent track	0.57
wood-"dry"/Concrete Curved track	0.65

For Moderate Climate Track

wood-moderate/Concrete Tangent track	0.58
wood-moderate/Concrete Curved track	0.66

For "Wet" Climate Track (e.g. Southeastern US)

wood-"wet"/Concrete Tangent track	0.62
wood-"wet"/Concrete Curved track	0.71

Results and Conclusions

Summarizing the results of the analyses presented here gives the following ratios between wood and alternate tie costs on a \$/Mile/MGT basis.

For the simplified analysis based on tie installation costs and total tie life (in MGT) (not accounting for the time value of money)

Wood/Concrete 1		Tangent	Mod Curve
Low Tonnage	10	0.56	0.64
Med Tonnage	25	0.60	0.64
High Tonnage	50	0.60	0.68

For "Dry" Climate Track (Western US)

Wood/Concrete 2		Tangent	Mod Curve
\$/Mile/MGT	MGT		
Low Tonnage	10	0.70	0.79
Med Tonnage	25	0.75	0.80
High Tonnage	50	0.75	0.86

Wood/Plastic		Tangent	Mod Curve
Low Tonnage	10	0.70	0.70
Med Tonnage	50	0.70	0.70
High Tonnage	50	0.70	0.70

Wood/Steel 1		Tangent	Mod Curve
Low Tonnage	10	0.75	0.80
Med Tonnage	25	0.77	0.80
High Tonnage	50	0.77	0.84

For Moderate Climate Track

Wood/Concrete 1		Tangent	Mod Curve
Low Tonnage	10	0.62	0.70
Med Tonnage	25	0.63	0.71
High Tonnage	50	0.65	0.74

Wood/Concrete 2		Tangent	Mod Curve
Low Tonnage	10	0.77	0.87
Med Tonnage	50	0.79	0.89
High Tonnage	50	0.82	0.93

Wood/Plastic		Tangent	Mod Curve
Low Tonnage	10	0.77	0.77
Med Tonnage	25	0.74	0.78
High Tonnage	50	0.77	0.76

Wood/Steel 1		Tangent	Mod Curve
Low Tonnage	10	0.82	0.88
Med Tonnage	25	0.82	0.89
High Tonnage	50	0.84	0.91

For "Wet" Climate Track (representative of Southeastern US)

Wood/Concrete 1		Tangent	Mod Curve
Low Tonnage	10	0.82	0.92
Med Tonnage	25	0.83	0.94
High Tonnage	50	0.86	0.98

Wood/Concrete 2		Tangent	Mod Curve
Low Tonnage	10	1.02	1.15
Med Tonnage	25	1.04	1.18
High Tonnage	50	1.08	1.23

Wood/Plastic		Tangent	Mod Curve
Low Tonnage	10	1.02	1.02
Med Tonnage	25	0.98	1.04
High Tonnage	50	1.02	1.01

Wood/Steel 1		Tangent	Mod Curve
Low Tonnage	10	1.09	1.16
Med Tonnage	25	1.08	1.18
High Tonnage	50	1.12	1.20

Life Cycle Analysis

For Moderate tonnage (25 MGT) tangent track

For "Dry" Climate Track (Western US)

wood-"dry"/Plastic	0.70
wood-"dry"/Steel 1	0.75

For Moderate Climate Track

wood-mod/Plastic	0.77
wood-mod/Steel 1	0.83

For "Wet" Climate Track (e.g. Southeastern US)

wood-"wet"/Plastic	0.89
wood-"wet"/Steel 1	0.96

For Moderate tonnage (25 MGT) curved track

For "Dry" Climate Track (Western US)

wood-"dry"/Plastic	0.70
wood-"dry"/Steel 1	0.75

For Moderate Climate Track

wood-mod/Plastic	0.77
wood-mod/Steel 1	0.82

For "Wet" Climate Track (e.g. Southeastern US)

wood-"wet"/Plastic	0.96
wood-"wet"/Steel 1	1.02

SelecTie Model

For Moderate tonnage (25 MGT) tangent and curved track

For "Dry" Climate Track (Western US)

wood-"dry"/Concrete Tangent track	0.57
wood-"dry"/Concrete Curved track	0.65

For Moderate Climate Track

wood-moderate/Concrete Tangent track	0.58
wood-moderate/Concrete Curved track	0.66

For "Wet" Climate Track (e.g. Southeastern US)

wood-"wet"/Concrete Tangent track	0.62
wood-"wet"/Concrete Curved track	0.71

Thus it can be seen that in general, wood ties have a lower cost per mile per MGT than any of the alternate tie configurations, except for applications in wet climates where the tie life is significantly reduced or for severe curvature high density applications.

In general, for moderate density tangent track of the order of 25 MGT per year located in a moderate climate zone of the US, wood tie costs (\$/mile/MGT) are of the order of 60 to 80% of concrete tie track; 70 to 75% of plastic (composite) ties, and 80 to 85% of steel tie track costs.

For moderate density moderate curvature track (25 MGT per year) located in a moderate climate zone of the US, wood tie costs (\$/mile/MGT) are of the order of 65 to 85% of concrete tie track; 70 to 80% of plastic (composite) ties, and 80 to 90% of steel tie track costs.

For dry climates, the wood tie costs represent a corresponding smaller percentage of the costs of alternate tie types; for wet climates, they represent a correspondingly higher percentage of the costs of alternate tie types.